

To Accreditation Council
of Eurasian Center
for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance
In Higher Education and Health Care

December 24, 2021

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children"
OF NJSC "Kazakh-Russian medical university»
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF
RESIDENCE) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: 13.12.-15.12.2021

Almaty, 2021

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1	The composition of the EEC	5
2	General part of the final report of the EEC	6
2.1	Presentation of “Kazakh-Russian medical university” and educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128-“Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children»	6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Analysis of the report on self-evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty7R01128-“Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children»	7
3	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4	Survey results	13
5	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment and an educational programme of residency in a specialty7R01128-“Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children» of NJSC “Kazakh-Russian medical university» and an overview of strengths for each standard	17
6	Recommendations for the improvement and educational programme of residency in the specialty7R01128-“Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children» of NJSC “Kazakh-Russian medical university»	24
7	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	24
	Attachment 1. Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation and Educational Programme of Residency in the Specialty7R01128-“Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children» of NJSC “Kazakh-Russian medical university» for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards	26
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of specialized accreditation	27
	Attachment 3. Photo report	28

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

GPA	Weighted average assessment of the level of educational achievements of a student in the chosen specialty
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem Based Learning
TBL	Team Oriented Learning
AIS NJSC "KRMU»	Automated information system of NJSC "Kazakh-Russian medical university»
AC NJSC"KRMU»	Academic Council of NJSC "Kazakh-Russian medical university»
JSC RICID	Joint Stock Company Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
BD	Basic disciplines (training)
GP	General practioner
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory educational standard
DAD	Department of Academic Development
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DET	Distance educational technologies
DEMW	Department of educational and methodical work
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
FSA	Final state attestation
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IEP	Individual educational plan (resident)
KRIOR	Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology
CVI	coronavirus infection
SC	Selectable Component
CEP	Committee for Educational Programmes
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CEL	Clinical experimental laboratory
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical Education Organization
MJ RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
NJSC "KRMU"	Non-commercial joint-stock company "Kazakh-Russian medical university»
RRW	Resident Research work
SSC	Scientific student circle
STP	Scientific and technical programme
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examination
SC	Science Center
SCS	Scientific Center of Surgery

SCOGP	Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology
SCPPS	Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery
life safety fundamentals	Fundamentals of life safety
PO	Public organization
EP	Educational programme
DPCEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
MT	Midterm
MD	Major disciplines (training)
PHC	Primary Health Care
DMP	Noncommunicable Disease Management Programme
RSE on PVC	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management
WC	Working curricula
QMS	Quality Management System
SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
SIW	Student Independent work
SRR	Student Research Work
SC	Simulation Center
RIWT	Resident Independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TEP	Typical Educational Plan
ERWR	Educational and research work of residents
EMA	Educational-methodical association
UH	University Hospital
SC	Scientific Council
CCU	Centre of collective usage
ACC	Alumni Career Center
STE	School of Teaching Excellence

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 32 dated November 23, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties of the National Educational Institution "KRMU", including in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" during the period December 13-15, 2021 in the following composition:

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission	ZHANALINA BAKHYT SEKERBEKOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Excellence in Public Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan tel.
foreign expert	OLEG MIKHAILOVICH URYASIEV, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with Courses of Endocrinology, General Physiotherapy, Clinical Pharmacology, Occupational Diseases and Military Field Therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the "Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov" of the Ministry of Health of Russia.
National academic expert	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, Leading Researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty
Expert - representative of employers	MUSABAYEVA ASEM MURATOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chief Physician of the Municipal State Enterprise on REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" of the Public Health Department of Almaty City, MBA, organizer of health care of the highest qualification category
Expert - representative of residents	ZIA AZIMKHAN NURZHANYLY Resident of the third year of study in the specialty "Urology and andrology for adults, children" JSC "Scientific Center of Urology named after Academician B.U. Dzharbusynov"

ECAQA Observer- Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, head of the accreditation and monitoring department of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care".

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 32 of November 23, 2021).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" "KRMU" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty of residency) of ECAQA medical education institutions, recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of the educational activities of "KRMU" in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Representation of the NJSC "Kazakh-Russian medical university» and educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children"

NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as the University) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI was renamed into the Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is an educational institution that provides students with a competitive higher and postgraduate medical education with a state diploma.

The University currently represents a medical education organization with a private form of ownership, which has the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 02, 2010). The University trains specialists at the levels: bachelor's, internship, residency and master's on the basis of existing state licenses at the levels of higher and postgraduate, additional education in accordance with the current State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and also implements additional education programmes.

Based on the order of acting Chairperson of the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 No. 264 at the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" a master's programme was opened in the specialties 6M110100 "Medicine" (license No. 0137388) and 6M110200 "Public health care" (license No. 0162831).

Since 2011, the university has been quarterly publishing the journal "Actual Problems of Theoretical and Clinical Medicine".

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific and technical activities, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

Training of students is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. The form of education is full-time, full-time. Over 29 years of activity, the University has trained over 6,000 specialists who successfully work in practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In 2021, the University was accredited by the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care» (certificate of international institutional accreditation dated June 17, 2021 IA00039, valid from 06/17/2021 to 06/16/2026)

In 2016, 6 undergraduate educational programmes, 13 residency educational programmes in the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) passed specialized accreditation.

The University also carries out its Mission through the implementation of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education at the levels of bachelor's, master's and residency, the objectives of which are: to train competitive specialists who can meet the needs of society in the provision of medical care, to apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, to use advances in information and communication technologies, improve the health of the population.

University management is implemented through collegiate bodies: Scientific Council (SC), Academic Council (AC), Scientific and Clinical Council (SCC), Local Ethical Commission (LEK),

Coordinating Council for Quality and Strategic Development (CCQSD), Council of Young Scientists and Student scientific society (CYS and SSS).

The University develops its activities through the Strategic Development Plan of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (long-term) (<http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/>) and the Tactical Plan for the Implementation of the Strategy (academic year), which are discussed and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University with the participation of stakeholders.

The National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational residency programmes. In 2011, there was the first set of residents in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children."

In accordance with the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No. KR DSM - 43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programmes", the educational programme 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" was renamed to 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" .

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" was carried out in 2016 by the IAAR accreditation body.

2.3 Analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children."

Preparation for specialized accreditation 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of order No. self-assessment of educational programmes".

The self-evaluation report of the educational programme is presented on 126 pages of the main text, 13 appendices in PDF format.

The report is characterized by completeness of responses to the criteria of all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for Self-Evaluation of ECAQA Educational Programmes, as well as internal unity of information.

The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the rector Dzhaynakbaev N.T., confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report provided by the accredited organization.

The report contains information about the representative of the National Educational Institution "KRMU", responsible for conducting self-assessment of educational programmes -Imanbayeva Zhaisan Abilseitovna,vice-rector on scientific and clinical work.

The self-assessment report is accompanied by a list of members of the working group for self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of the specialty 7R01128 - "Adult, children Otorhinolaryngology", indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission.

The working group for the preparation of the self-assessment report did a certain job: analyzed the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staff, educational resources, the dynamics of development since the date of the previous accreditation in 2016, collected the necessary information in accordance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (specialties of residency) of ECAQA medical educational institutions (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards), analysis, updating of methodological and educational materials, relevant residency documents (regulations, rules), their content is reflected in the report. The self-assessment and description was carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the answers to the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were received.

All standards provide the real practice of the KRMU for the preparation of residents in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children." Residency training is started in 2011, in 2020-2021 studied on 7 and 2021-2022 - 44 residents. The introduction contains fairly complete information about the medical organization - the history of occurrence, scientific achievements,

personnel, etc. The report is written in a competent language, consistent with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and have consecutive numbering. There are links to legal acts, model rules, regulations, educational and methodological documents, website pages <https://medkrmu.kz/rezidentura-3/>

The self-assessment report contains reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, assessment of residents, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently completed and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, mentors, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (medical organizations, practice bases, universities), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and prospects for development in this specialty.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report was structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guide, at the same time, based on the results of the review, recommendations were made for adjustment, which were taken into account by the working group.

Thus, the report on the self-assessment of the accredited educational programme of residency 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" of the KRMU contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the departments made the appropriate corrections in the report at the review stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017 d.) and according to the programme and schedule approved on November 23, 2021 by ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector prof. Dzhaynakbaev N.T.

To obtain objective information on the expert evaluation of the accredited educational programme, the EEC members used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents and teachers, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, questioning teachers and residents, review of resources with a visit to clinical sites in the context of meeting accreditation standards, attending practical (seminar) classes for residents, including online during a pandemic, studying regulatory and educational documents both before and during the visit to the KRMU.

On the part of the university staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites was ensured (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

No.	FULL NAME.	Position
1.	Kusainova A.S.	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
2.	Imanbayeva Zh.A.	Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work
3.	Sovostyanova T.A.	Acting vice-rector for educational work
4.	Orakbay L.Zh.	head of residency department
5.	Kulebaeva E.K.	career center manager

6.	Iskakova D.A.	Head of the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility
7.	Verevkin V.I.	head of personnel department
8.	Vdovtsev A.V.	responsible for the mobile medical complex
9.	Seidalin A.O.	head of department of scientific work
10.	Mansharipova A.T.	Scientific Secretary
11.	Aumoldaeva Z.M.	head of the educational and clinical center
12.	Kerimbekova A.A.	Head of Department of Distance Educational Technologies
13.	Mokhirev A. A.	Operator of the Department of Distance Educational Technologies
14.	Manapova D.E.	test center manager
15.	Kaliova G. B.	head of the registrar's office
16.	Amirov D.K.	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work City Clinical Hospital No. 5
17.	Taukelova Saule Aidaratovna	MD Head of the Department Professor of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology
18.	Burkutbaeva Tatyana Nuridenovna	PhD Associate Professor of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology

The sequence of the visit during December 13-15, 2021 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the Attachment to this report.

At the beginning of the visit, the leadership of the University presented EEC and information about the purpose of the visit. This interview made it possible to determine evidence that the mission of the residency programme and the mission of the university are fully consistent with each other. The vice-rector announced a strategy for the development of postgraduate education, including residency programmes, which indicates a clear vision of the university and an interest in improving residency programmes, taking into account the needs of practical health care. The interview with the management made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria of accreditation standards 1,8,9, to identify approaches to the development of the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university.

During the visit, it was determined how the Internal Quality Assurance Policy in postgraduate education functions in the context of the ESG. To search for evidence of compliance with standard 4, the expert clarified the current status of a resident in accordance with the Health Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The following tasks of the dean's office were also analyzed: the formation of a state order for specialties, the admission of residents, the provision of resources, the evaluation of residency educational programmes. It has been established that the dean's office closely cooperates with the departments that train residents. The resources of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01128 - "Adult, children Otorhinolaryngology" are provided by cooperation with such foreign partners from the Russian Federation (SSMU "Saratov State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, SSMU "Omsk State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation) and Greece (University of Ioannina (University of Ioannina, Greece), as well as Israel (Training and Medical Center "Carmel Medcurator LTD "). Residents are expected to work in clinics in a safe environment. The experts found that the university strictly complies with the requirements of regulatory legal acts and state educational standards in the implementation of the educational programme, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.). The basis of effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy "KRMU" and, developed within the framework of academic freedom, at each department "Department Policies" for residents, as well as following the Quality Manual when documenting the educational process.

During an interview with the head of the Alumni Career Center experts assessed approaches to the implementation of monitoring the employment of residents. In general, the employment rate is very

high and amounts to 100%, including in the accredited specialty. At the same time, it is necessary to carry out monitoring for several years. The experts studied the results of a survey of graduates and employers on the level of satisfaction of employers and other stakeholders with the quality of training of residents. The results of the survey showed the satisfaction of employers with the quality of training of residents (theoretical training, possession of practical skills, communication skills, etc.). Graduates of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" work as teachers in university departments, doctors in medical organizations of the country, and continue their doctoral studies.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, an interview was conducted with 4 graduates of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" on the zoom platform (Deev Y.I., Bakhalov R.M., Zayirov D. .K., Kokenova A.K.), who gave positive feedback about training in residency, participation in research, in the development of an educational programme.

Experts received information on providing staff for residency departments, compliance with qualification requirements for teaching staff. The policy of recruitment of mentors, the system of motivation of teaching staff and mentors used in the university and its results are analyzed. All teaching staff working with residents in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" have an academic degree, mentors are doctors of the highest category with extensive work experience.

The commission visited a mobile diagnostic center and hemodialysis station (QEP), which is a "hospital on wheels" equipped with modern equipment, including a novelty in the field of diagnosing cardiovascular diseases - the "cardiovisor" device. Mobile medical complexes: diagnostic, surgical, hemodialysis, rescue, are designed on the basis of highly passable trucks and allow for the most complex research in the field.

The experts received reliable information about the scientific directions of the university, the system of motivation and participation in research for teachers of residency and residents departments, about the organization of the implementation of research by residents on the bases of practice, the possibility of publishing the results of research by residents and teachers in journals, including the university "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine" . Over the past 5 years, the staff of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology has published 37 scientific articles in journals, while residents have not yet made a single publication.

Interviews were held with residents, with the EEC divided into 5 sub-groups to explore in more detail issues related to training, resources and teaching methods. The work was carried out in 3 subgroups, where 13 residents were present at the interview, 4 of them under the specialty programme 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" (Zhursinbekov D. - 1 year of study, Bashirov Bashir - 2 years of study, Musirali Zh. - 3 years of study). The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training at the National Educational Institution "KRMU", the sufficiency of time for curating patients, working with medical records at Damumed, about satisfaction with teaching and assessment methods, about the qualifications of teachers, curators, mentors, social and moral support for residents who need it, availability of a resource of international databases of professional literature.

Residents of the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children", in addition to practical work with ENT patients, actively participate in research activities, make presentations, and carry out preventive measures (lectures on the prevention of ENT diseases).

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, financing, demonstrated competence in answering questions from a foreign expert, Professor Khasanov A.I. . (Uzbekistan).

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts conducted interviews with teachers as providers of the residency programme. As a result of the interview, information was obtained on personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Interviews with 15 teachers of the university, including 3 teaching staff of departments in the specialty 7R01128 "Otorhinolaryngology for adults,

children."

The Dean's Office of Postgraduate Education is the main developer of programmes and educational and methodological documentation, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentoring. Teachers from the Department of ENT Diseases told how they initiate research topics for residents, encourage them to receive additional competencies (online training), and stimulate independent work with literature and medical documentation.

Vice-Rector for Research and Clinical Affairs Imanbayeva Zh. A. reported to the experts on the availability of resources for clinical practice and the work of residents, on cooperation with clinical sites. Zhaisan Abilseitovna gave a description of mentoring in residency, representation of residents in the consultative and advisory bodies (CAB) of the university. It was noted that residents of the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" are not represented in the advisory bodies.

An interview with the head of the department of distance learning technologies made it possible to determine the fulfillment of the criteria for accreditation standards 4.7, to identify how planning takes place, the procedure for developing and approving educational programmes, monitoring the quality of the implementation of residency programmes, innovations in teaching and assessment. One of the tasks of the work of the CEP is to improve residency training programmes. It is confirmed that residents of the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" take part in the development of the educational programme and electives through participation in surveys and questionnaires.

Second day of the visit is **14 December 2021**

As part of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the Medline Medical Center was visited, where the department of otorhinolaryngology and a hospital for 20 beds are located. The bases for training residents are also the Center for Primary Health care Complex and the City Clinical Hospital No. 5, which provide round-the-clock highly qualified emergency consultative, diagnostic and inpatient medical care to the adult population with ENT pathology. In the structure of the hospitals there are: 13 training rooms, a reception and consultative department for round-the-clock reception of patients with various nosologies, where patients are examined, delivered by ambulance teams and referred by doctors of polyclinics and other medical and preventive organizations and self-treatment. Operating block visited where endoscopic rhinosinus surgery operations are performed (Professor MD Taukelova S.A.). A practical lesson was attended by residents of the 1st year of study on the topic "Acute and otitis media and mastoiditis" (candidate of medical sciences, associate professor Esenalieva R.N.).

Residents at the clinical base from the first days are involved in clinical activities, participate in all activities, including duty, consultations, clinical reviews. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training. Resident otorhinolaryngologists have the opportunity to combine their studies with work in a hospital and clinics.

The review of resources showed that the clinical base of the university for the implementation of an accredited educational programme, available for review at the time of the external visit, meets the goals and objectives, as it has a sufficient number of patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and mentors, provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

Documentation reviewed by an expert according to the educational programme 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" at the link <http://www.iaar.kz/ru/accreditation-ru/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya#> which confirmed compliance with accreditation standards, including documentation of 7 faculty members, 14 resident mentors and at the request of the EEC members. The documentation confirms the compliance with the accreditation standards (nomenclature of affairs of the department, plan for 5 years, annual plan and report of the departments, journal of progress of residents, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with residents, teachers, reports on the results of the survey and measures taken, code of ethics, etc., control - measuring instruments), including documentation (Regulations on residency, Rules for admission to residency, Educational programme, syllabuses, checklists).

The experts got acquainted with the documents of the residents (individual plan of the resident, portfolio, assessments of the residents, checklists, results of the residents' survey, lists of works and publications).

Interviews were conducted with 4 otorhinolaryngologist residents who were at this clinical base in order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the educational programme, the sufficiency of thematic patients, the time for maintaining medical records, and independent work of residents. The expert asked questions about satisfaction with training at the university, the sufficiency of time for practical training, curation of patients and work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods and purposefully entered this university, as they believe that KRMU has excellent clinical facilities and experience in teaching residents.

One of the important tools of accreditation expertise is the conduct and interviews with employers - representatives of practical health care who are not affiliated with the "KRMU". A total of 12 people were interviewed. Interviews with employers for all educational residency programmes applied for accreditation of "KRMU" conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies of NJSC "KRMU", satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of residency graduates, etc. Employer in the specialty 7R01128 "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" was Nurbaev Rolan Mamyrovich, director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Almaty Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", noted the high preparedness of resident otorhinolaryngologists, great practical assistance. The employer actively participated in the development of the educational programme, they proposed to include an elective discipline in otorhinolaryngology.

Thus, during the first day of the visit, the expert validated the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme according to all accreditation standards.

The third day of the visit is December 15, 2021.

Valuable provision of the residency programme with educational, methodological and scientific literature, including electronic forms. So, in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" there are textbooks on ENT diseases in Russian and the state languages: Bogomilsky M.R. Diseases of the ear, throat, nose in acute respiratory infections in children (Series Library of a specialist doctor); V. T. Palchun, M. M. Magomedov, A. V. Gurov. A short course in otorhinolaryngology. GEOTAR-Media. 2016 288s.; ed. M.R. Bogomilsky, V.R. Chistyakova. National leadership. Diseases of the ear, throat, nose in childhood. Brief edition (Series "National guides"). GEOTAR-Media. 2015 544s.; ed. V.T. Palchun. National leadership. Otorhinolaryngology. - 2nd ed., revised. and additional (Series "National guides"). GEOTAR-Media. 2016 1024s; ed. S. A. Karpishchenko. Otorhinolaryngology: textbook (specialty 31.05.01 "General Medicine"). GEOTAR-Media. 2018 464s.; Surgery middle ear: atlas. Gersdorf M. BINOMIAL. 2014G.152With.; Surgery larynx and trachea. Remacle Mark. BINOMIAL, 2014G. 368 page.

Employees of the departments produce scientific and educational products for residents. The university acquires specialized medical journals on otorhinolaryngology: Head and neck surgery, Russian rhinology; Journal of Throat-Nasal Diseases; News of otorhinolaryngology and logopathology, St. Petersburg; Folia magazine, Moscow.

There is access to 5 international databases, which provides the opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and other events. The EEC members noted the effective work of the library in helping to provide residents and teachers with literature.

Further, a final discussion of the results of the external evaluation, the study of documents, the results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires was held. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. The expert individually completed the "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria for the Educational

Residency Programme in the Specialty 7R01128 – Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate sector of education in general and the department implementing the educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

By the chairperson of the EEC prof. Zhanalina B.S. a final open vote was held on recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external evaluation as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

4. The results of the survey.

On December 13-15, 2021, an ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of residents and teachers on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

The survey of residents included 24 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of respondents to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

Results of the poll of residents. A total of 177 respondents were surveyed, including 90 residents of the KRMU, of which 42.2% are residents of the 1st year of study, 32.2% - 2 years of study, 25.5% - 3 years of study. They will recommend to study in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives - 70.62% fully agree, partially agree - 23.73% totally disagree with this statement- 2.82%.

74.58% of respondents fully agree, 20.34% partially agree, 2.26% strongly disagree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their problems related to training. 72.88% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies, and the rest (8.47%) are partially unaware (8.47%) of the respondents.

Satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of the university. Fully (66.1%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and auditoriums of the university. partially (25.9%) and completely dissatisfied (3.95%) with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and auditoriums of the university.

In this educational organization, conditions have been created for students to rest and eat (rest rooms, benches / pavilions on the territory, buffet-dining room) in between classes, they completely agree (68.93%), disagree (8.47%) of the respondents.

Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) is available for students in classrooms and practice bases, fully agree (69.41%), partially agree (19.21%).

In the opinion of 78.53% (fully) and 13.56% (partially) agree that the Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. 72.32% fully agree with the provision of the necessary educational literature, 14.69% partially agree.

The availability of medical services for the student is fully agreed (71.19), partially (26.38%) of the respondents. Satisfaction with the activities of mentors, curators, supervisors fully agree (81.5%), partially (10.5%). Teachers and employees of the educational organization treat students with respect Agree (91.53%), No Disagree (6.21%) of the respondents. Fully agree (75.71%) and disagree (5.65%) that the organization of education has and implements social programmes to support students. Fully agree (80.71%) and disagree (12.43%) that the educational organization has established a system of self-study for students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and listeners. Fully satisfied (81.36%) and partially satisfied (16.38%) respondents with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme. Fully satisfied (81.36%) and partially satisfied (11.86%) with the methods of assessing their knowledge and skills. 73.45% of respondents believe that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23%

of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 86%) by methods of assessing their knowledge and skills. 73.45% of respondents believe that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 86%) by methods of assessing their knowledge and skills. 73.45% of respondents believe that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 58% of respondents like to study in this educational institution, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. 58% of respondents like to study in this educational institution, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers.

46.89% of the respondents answered that they are currently engaged in research work, 35.03% of respondents are not involved in research activities and 10.73% of respondents plan to start doing research activities.

38.98% of the respondents answered that they have more than one (11.38%) printed works (articles, abstracts, reviews) personally published during their studies at this educational institution, and (18.64%) do not have any one publication, articles, abstracts, reviews.

Conclusions: in their responses, residents expressed their satisfaction with the organization of education in general, as well as the conditions of education, access to equipment, time for practical training, the number of patients for curation, and the organization of teaching.

On December 15, an observer from ECAQA, as part of the external evaluation programme, conducted a survey that included 39 questions to draw conclusions about the attitude of teachers to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes. Questioned 67 Teaching staff with more than 10 years of experience (46.27%), 5-10 years - (13.43%). I completely agree (85.07%) with satisfaction with the organization of the EP at this university, 10.45% - partly agree. Ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, management - I completely agree (80.6%), 13.43% - partly agree. I completely agree (76.12%) with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, 16.42% - partially. 79.1% of respondents fully agree that

there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teaching staff competencies at the university, 13.43% - partially agree. 73.13% of the teaching staff fully agree that this educational organization has the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, 17.91% - partially agree. 50.75% of respondents are satisfied with the salary as an employee involved in the educational process. 58.21% of teachers are involved in the development of methodological materials for the residency programme, 2.99% - partially. Teaching staff were trained in professional development courses during this year - 74.63%. 62.69% of respondents believe that the discipline they teach is adequately resourced. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican), 29.85% of respondents pay travel, registration fee, travel allowances, 2.99% pay only travel. 76.12% fully agree that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills. 44.78% of respondents confirm that the university implements social support programmes. 68.66% of respondents say that the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding the issues of the educational process, research, clinical work.

49.25% of the teachers surveyed use lectures in their practice, 80.6% - oral survey, 41.79% use problem-based learning, 71.64% use work in small groups. 68.66% of the teaching staff fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of your organization's activities. 23.88% of respondents included in the internal self-assessment committee

Conclusions: the survey showed that the majority of the teachers surveyed are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, observance of ethics and subordination, organization of labor and workplace, opportunities for career growth, the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of a centralized management of educational programmes.

Conclusion on the results of the external evaluation

The EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by the expert during the study of the self-assessment report was analyzed, during the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of the activities of the visit programme to the KRMU from 13 to 15 December 2021. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, validation of information was carried out for each criterion of the accreditation standards and verification of the indicators of the Attachment to the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided. University information and confirmation of 18 documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-evaluation report of the educational programme SCC described its real educational practice in postgraduate education. Over 25 documents were viewed by experts, as well as during an external expert evaluation, the members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring tools, checklists, portfolio of residents, individual plans of residents for 2021-2023, publications of teachers and residents, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, programme of internal quality assurance systems, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of the departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), residency resources on the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/>, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the activities of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

During the external examination, it was found that the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency are observed (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KP ДСМ-16). The volume of teaching load and treatment and preventive work in sections of the educational programme is determined by the individual work plan of the resident (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in any form. Accounting for completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of Order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes for medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 № [KRDSM-12/2020](#) Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), the educational programme has undergone changes and additions regarding the development of the research competence of residents, who must participate in the work of the research team.

In accordance with Article 222 Residency, paragraph 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the health of the people and the health care system dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI ZRK, external experts studied the activities and held conversations with mentors by residents, and it was established that each resident is provided with a mentor. There are up to 4 residents per tutor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" according to the current SES is being implemented for 3 academic years, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students and employers, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, elective topics, participation in appeal commissions for the admission and evaluation of residents, development of the content of individual plans of residents and the choice of mentors.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on 12/15/2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit (December 13-15, 2021) of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the university staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-evaluation report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the ECAQA medical education organization.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all the necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of employees responsible for postgraduate education of "KRMU", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" and a review of strengths for each standard

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of Compliance:

The team of departments implementing the residency programme in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" as the basis for the mission of the educational programme and goals, accepted the mission of the university and informed interested parties (teachers, employers, residents) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive for meeting the needs of practical health care. The structure of the educational programme, where there is a dominance of practical training (75%), the sufficiency of clinical facilities and the mentoring system make it possible to strengthen the patient-oriented approach in the implementation of patient care and treatment. The university organized training and clinical practice in compliance with safety for all participants in the educational process (safety, use of PPE, briefing before the start of training).

The educational programme (EP) in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" is aimed at realizing the mission of the University through the training of a qualified specialist

doctor with a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity in the treatment of ENT diseases. *At the same time, there is no separate mission of the educational programme.*

Those responsible for the residency programme of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology and Pediatric ENT Diseases apply a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing the development of basic and special competencies of residents, namely, work at the patient's bedside, clinical reviews, solving situational problems, protecting case histories. Residents are actively involved in the scientific work of the departments.

The experts received convincing evidence that the University is autonomous in making decisions when developing an educational programme in terms of the elective component, current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (specialty examination), personnel policy in relation to teachers for an accredited educational programme, as well as the distribution of resources (audience fund of clinical sites according to agreements).

The EMCD defines the end results of training in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty of residency. The departments implement cooperation with foreign partners from Russian Federation (Saratov State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Omsk State Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation), Greece (University of Joannina / University of Yanina) and Israel (Training and Medical Center "Carmel Medcurator LTD").

The university has developed a Code of Ethics for the student with which residents are familiarized and systematic work is being carried out to develop and improve communication skills, which is integrated into the work programme.

Representatives of practical health care and residents participate in the development of the mission and goals of the University, in the formation of a catalog of elective disciplines (CED). The effectiveness of the educational programme is evidenced by 100% employment.

In general, standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

Strengths:

1. Good clinical base in the largest clinics in Almaty and the Republic of Kazakhstan for training residents

2. The final results of the training of residents are clearly spelled out.

3. Residents are active in addressing social definitions of health

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Comply out of 17 standard: fully - 16, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Formulate the mission of the educational programme and discuss with stakeholders employers, residents and professional associations.

2. To raise awareness of all stakeholders, update on a regular basis information about the mission of the residency educational programme and the final results of training on the official website of the University, as well as using social networks, printed materials, banners and other information opportunities.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

Evidence of Compliance:

The residency programme in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015. A lot of work is constantly being done to improve educational and methodological materials, develop the competencies of teachers and resident mentors. A competency model for residents has been introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development, approval of the residency programme is clearly

defined and regulated by the Committee of Educational Programmes (CEP).

The staff of the departments has the necessary competencies to train residents. Every year the department determines mentors who are doctors of the highest category, with a long work experience. There are up to 4 residents per tutor. Department lecturers use a variety of interactive and traditional teaching methods, according to which staff members are periodically trained for and within the university. Teaching methods - seminars, webinars, conferences, case studies, problem-based learning (PBL), case-based learning (CBL), team-based learning (TBL), clinical case analysis, medical record keeping, medical quality assessment care, case management, education in primary health care and hospital settings, medical conferences, consultations, clinical reviews. The emphasis in training is on working at the bedside. The dean's office is trying to monitor this process and train newly hired teachers through the School of Pedagogical Excellence.

Due to the availability of clinical sites for residents, they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical records, including automated health care systems. Mentors play a big role in this. When conducting interviews with residents, the experts were convinced that the organization of training and work is focused on patients. During a pandemic, there is not always a sufficient number of thematic patients, so cases of real patients are used, a theoretical analysis of complex topics is carried out and literature is studied in modern databases. Clinical training is carried out in the conditions of accredited clinics.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied, training is carried out by curators, mentors.

Thus, the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" demonstrates compliance with the implementation of the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: a developed and approved educational programme that meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard and is implemented in a student-oriented and patient-oriented environment in certified clinics of the city. The educational programme is provided with relevant methodological documentation and documents accompanying the residents. Teachers effectively apply various teaching methods, involve residents in R&D, which contributes to the formation and development of competencies in the specialty.

Strengths:

1. The educational programme is developed on the basis of a competence-oriented model of a residency graduate, taking into account the needs of society and the labor market.
2. Patient-oriented and safe learning environment.
3. Professional teaching staff using innovative teaching methods, mentoring system.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Comply out of 32 standard: fully - 32, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: No

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of Compliance:

The KRMU has developed and implemented a policy for assessing residents, including the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the section "Academic Mobility" on the website www.krmu-edu.kz, regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students of the KRMU. Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents lies with the faculty of the departments, heads of departments, the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by the departments - control questions, tasks in a test form (MCQ tasks with multiple correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is available on the website www.krmu-edu.kz.

As an additional method of assessing residents, portfolios are used, which the expert got acquainted with at the departments supervising the residency programmes. Residents are engaged in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences. Evaluation of scientific work also affects the overall assessment of the discipline.

A mini-clinical exam checklist is used to assess practical skills, but there is no assessment of communication skills.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Model Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020. in residency specialties. The results of students' educational achievements are entered into an electronic educational journal through the office-registrar system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets.

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the interim and final certification of residents is determined in the Academic Policy for the 2021-2022 academic year.

The procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and reviewing assessment methods in the KRMU ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring tools is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in residency, then implemented at the department.

Thus, this standard is generally fulfilled at the university.

Strengths:

1. The electronic system "Platonus", which ensures transparency and speed of accounting for the results of the assessment of residents.

2. Portfolio assessment, which allows assessing the development of the resident's competencies: personal interest, professional competence, communicative, personal qualities, scientific interest.

3. The system for monitoring the educational achievements of residents is complex and is aimed at assessing the final results of education.

Conclusions of EEC according to the criteria. Out of 11 standards conform: fully - 10, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Include an assessment of communication skills in the checklist of the mini-clinical exam.

2. Improve the procedure for documenting the reliability and validity of methods of assessment formats in relation to the established outcomes.

Standard 4: STUDENTS

Evidence of Compliance:

Admission to residency at the KRMU is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Model Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education". The number of residents is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical health care. The criteria for applicants entering residency are determined by the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master educational residency programmes: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship. Information on the required list of documents for admission to residency is posted on the website of the KRMU, as well as in the selection committee.

The University has developed a document "Rules for admission to residency", on the basis of which residents are admitted.

Strengths:

1. Participation of residents in all medical events of clinical sites

2. Ability to implement research competence

3. High commitment and continuity of residency students to this university.

Conclusions of EEC according to the criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully - 29, partially - 1 (improvement standard), do not correspond - 0.

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To intensify the work of residents in the research activities of the university and the department.

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of Compliance:

The KRMU applies effective and transparent recruitment and appointment criteria for teaching staff and guarantees equal employment opportunities consistent with legal requirements and any other selection criteria. The Department of Otorhinolaryngology has a sufficient number of highly qualified teachers who meet the needs of the mission and the successful implementation of the educational programme for residency 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children."

The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total teaching load. Clinical mentors from practical health care involved in teaching residents are subject to such requirements as the presence of basic education, the presence of a medical qualification category and sufficient work experience in the specialty. The teaching staff of the department constantly improve their qualifications in pedagogical and clinical areas.

Strengths:

1. The faculty of the department consists of highly qualified employees with scientific achievements, high medical qualifications, who are experts in health care and medical education.

2. Close relationship between teachers of departments and practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Conclusions of EEC according to the criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: fully - 7, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. More actively involve foreign professors in the educational process.

2. Develop an assessment criterion that characterizes the activities of teachers and clinical mentors.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of Compliance:

The University has a developed material and technical base for the professional training of residents in the specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults and children." The material and technical base of the department includes the leading specialized medical clinics in Almaty. The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the qualitative organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient care to the population of the region. Educational premises are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations, office equipment.

Strengths:

1. Sustainable material and technical base

2. Availability of a mobile medical complex for carrying out diagnostic and treatment-and-prophylactic measures for the adult and children's population of the Republic of Kazakhstan in emergency situations

3. Functioning of the Department of Distance Educational Technologies.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 20, partially - 1, do not meet - 0.

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To equip the training and clinical center in order to improve the quality of training of residents with dummies for practicing the provision of emergency and practical assistance to ENT patients and for working on the temporal bone. Purchase equipment for fibroendoscopic manipulations.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of Compliance:

Monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme is carried out at all levels of education, a multi-level approach is used, including major and related departments, the Committee for the educational programme of internship and residency, the Department of Academic Affairs (DAR), the Academic Committee, the Senate, the student government, the Center for Admission and Career Guidance students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students)). At the same time, there is no documented procedure for this process and there is not enough information on the participation of all stakeholder groups in assessing the quality of the educational process. Including graduates of the educational programme. However, in interviews with graduates, it was found that they are satisfied with the knowledge and skills which they received at the University and were able to independently apply them in practice. Independent monitoring of data on the implementation and achievement of the final results of graduate education is carried out by the National Center for Independent Examination and through a survey of employers. Which is not yet regular. According to the results of such an assessment, elective topics are introduced into the catalog of elective disciplines (CED), which allow to enhance the achievement of the expected final education of residents.

Strengths:

1. Involvement in the evaluation of educational programmes of students, teachers, employers
2. External and internal evaluation of the educational programme is carried out by leading specialists of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of otorhinolaryngology.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Comply out of 15 standards: fully - 14, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Improve the process of monitoring and evaluating the educational programme by developing an appropriate document (regulations, rules, regulations) and broadly involving residents, graduates, employers and other stakeholders in the evaluation of educational programmes.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of Compliance:

KRMU in the implementation of postgraduate education is guided by the legislation in the field of education and health care, which regulate the number of state educational orders for the training of residents in the field of health care.

Administration and management of the educational process in residency and in the educational programme is carried out within the framework of the approved organizational structure of the University, which is annually reviewed and adjusted if there are reasonable reasons for its change.

The three-day external visit of the experts demonstrated the existence of a strong system of administration, which in a number of cases has a strict controlling character, starting with the first head and vice-rectors. At the same time, the residency and internship department and the departments in charge of the educational programme have the appropriate autonomy in the development and implementation of the educational programme, the choice of clinical sites and the implementation of joint activities with practical health care, the conclusion of cooperation agreements with foreign universities, the initiation of innovative teaching methods, topics of research. The experts drew attention to the need to strengthen support for teachers in their participation in international professional and educational events, the development of pedagogical competencies, especially for young teachers. For these purposes, the School of Pedagogical Excellence operates at the University. This unit should actively collect feedback from departments on topics to improve pedagogical

competence.

The financial sources of the University are diverse, including the state order for the education of students, residents and paid educational and medical services. The university demonstrates financial sustainability and strategic planning in the allocation of resources to various expenditure items. Over the past 5 years, the University has been rebranded, updating the website, the equipment of the educational and clinical center, equipping the departments and IT equipment. There is a position of a marketer in the state.

All management structures are aimed at the effective implementation of the educational programme and improving the image of the university in postgraduate education. Over the past 2 years, the gradualness of teaching staff has increased by 1.5 times and the number of clinical sites has increased, which is aimed at strengthening the professional base for training future doctors. At the same time, there is an “aging” of personnel, the predominance of people of retirement age who do not fully possess the skills to use computer technology and independently prepare high-quality educational and methodological documentation, and a low level of initiation of scientific work.

Strengths:

1. Sustainable financial condition of the university.
2. Extensive collaboration with partners in the health sector.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Comply out of 15 standards: fully - 15, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: No

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Evidence of Compliance:

In order to continuously improve the postgraduate educational process in accordance with the best practice of world educational management, the KRMU, taking into account the needs of practical health care in the Republic of Kazakhstan, initiates a review and update of the process. Based on the analysis of the documented review at all levels, resources are allocated and an action plan is determined to update the postgraduate educational process, improve management, update the goal of the strategic plan in terms of educational activities, structure and content, taking into account the needs of practical health care, ensure improved learning outcomes / competencies, learning environment programmes.

Strengths:

1. The University has a system of continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria. Comply out of 4 standards: fully - 4, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: No

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards were met, no discrepancies in the fulfillment of the criteria for each of the basic accreditation standards were found in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting an examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the

specialty 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children's":

Standard 1

1. Formulate the mission of the educational programme and discuss with stakeholders, employers, residents, professional associations.

2. In order to raise awareness of all stakeholders, update information on the mission of the residency educational programme and the final learning outcomes on the official website of the University, as well as using social networks, printed materials, banners and other information opportunities on a regular basis.

Standard 3

3. Include an assessment of communication skills in the checklist of the mini-clinical exam.

4. Improve the procedure for documenting the reliability and validity of methods of assessment formats in relation to the established outcomes.

Standard 4

5. To intensify the work of residents in the research activities of the university and the department.

Standard 5

6. More actively involve foreign professors in the educational process.

7. Develop an assessment criterion that characterizes the activities of teachers and clinical mentors.

Standard 6

8. To equip the training and clinical center in order to improve the quality of training of residents with dummies for practicing the provision of emergency and practical assistance to ENT patients and for working on the temporal bone. Purchase equipment for fibroendoscopic manipulations.

Standard 7

9. Improve the process of monitoring and evaluating the educational programme by developing an appropriate document (regulations, rules, regulations) and broadly involving residents, graduates, employers and other stakeholders in the evaluation of educational programmes.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme of residency 7R01128 - "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" of the National Educational Institution of Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University for a period of 5 years

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission	ZHANALINA BAKHYT SEKERBEKOVNA
foreign expert	OLEG MIKHAILOVICH URYASIEV
foreign expert	KHASANOV ADKHAM IBRAGIMOVICH
Kazakh academic expert	DZHANDAIEV SERIK ZHAKENOVICH
Expert - representative of employers	MUSABAYEVA ASEM MURATOVNA
Expert - representative of residents	ZIA AZIMKHAN NURZHANULY

**Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (generalization)
Of educational programme in the specialty
7R01128 "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children" of KRMU**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	TOTAL	Grade		
			Totally coincides	Partially Compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	16	1	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	32	32	0	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	10	1	
4.	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5.	FACULTY	7	7	0	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	14	1	
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15	0	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4	0	
	total	152	147	5	

List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of accreditation

No.	Document names	Quantity	Date of approval (if applicable)
1.	Academic policy	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
2.	Regulations on the current control, intermediate and final certification of students of the NEI KRMU	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
3.	Rules for admission to residency	1	Pr. 7 dated 07/01/2020
4.	Regulations on academic mobility of students, teachers and staff	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
5.	Regulations on the clinical tutor	1	Minutes of the SCC No. 18 dated 17.06.2019
6.	Quality Policy and Objectives	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
7.	Strategic Development Plan of the National Educational Institution of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2019-2025	1	Pr. 96 dated 04/17/2019
8.	Formation, discussion, approval of the academic calendar	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 18.08.2021
9.	Approval of candidates for chairperson and composition of the SEC and SAC	1	Order No. 26-02-48-n/k dated 02.12.2020
10.	Personnel policy	1	SC No. 5 12/25/2020
11.	Internal regulations for students of NJSC KRMU	1	Etc. No. 347/1 dated 12/12/2017
12.	Regulations on the Institute of Postgraduate Education NJSC KRMU	1	01/09/2020
13.	Residency Student Handbook 2021-2022 academic year		08/18/2021
14.	Tactical plan of the NJSC KRMU in the field of quality for 2021-2022	1	Minutes No. 1 dated 28.08.2020
15.	Organizational structure of NJSC KRMU	1	Etc. No. 11 dated 06/29/2020
16.	Educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R01128– «Otorhinolaryngology for adults and children»	1	Etc. from 24.08.2020
17.	Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics	1	Etc. No. 4 dated 11/26/2021
18.	Regulations on the Committee of Educational Programmes	1	AC meeting dated 06.12.2021
19.	Code of academic honor for students of NJSC KRMU	1	Pr. 9 dated 04/27/2019
20.	Portfolio of residents 1,2,3	9	08/31/2021

	courses		
21	Syllabuses by disciplines of residency specialty 7R01128-«Otorhinolaryngology for adults and children».	3	08/31/2021
22	Gradebooks	1	Electronic variant
23	The annual plan of the department for 2021-2022 academic year	1	01.09.2021
24	Individual Resident Plan	6	08/31/2021
25	Schedule of cathedral meetings for the 2021-2022 academic year	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
26	Minutes of cathedral meetings 2021-2022 academic year	4	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
27	Evaluation sheets of resident doctors	2	
28	syllabuses	3	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
29	List of scientific works of the teaching staff of the department-"Otorhinolaryngology for adults and children»	1	
30	List of scientific works of resident otorhinolaryngologists	1	
31	Agreements with clinical bases	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
33	Review of test items	2	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
34	The list of control questions of midterm control	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021

Photo report

